Workforce Race Equality Standard Progress Report July 2018

Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) - Background

In response to the NHS Equality & Diversity Council announcement in July 2014 that it had agreed action to ensure employees from black and minority ethnic (BME) backgrounds have equal access to career opportunities and receive fair treatment in the workplace, the <u>Workforce Race</u> <u>Equality Standard</u> (WRES) was implemented.

There are nine WRES indicators. Four of the indicators focus on workforce data, four are based on data from the national NHS Staff Survey questions, and one indicator focuses upon black and minority ethnic (BME) representation on Boards. The WRES highlights any differences between the experience and treatment of white staff and BME staff in the NHS with a view to closing those gaps through the development and implementation of action plans focused upon continuous improvement over time.

NHS organisations published and or submitted WRES data for the first time in August 2015. This data presented each organisation's response to each of the nine WRES indicators and constitutes the WRES baseline. Alongside the WRES baseline data, organisations also developed Action Plans that outline the practical approach needed to continuously improve organisational performance with regard to workforce race equality.

From 2016/17, WRES reporting has been included in the NHS standard contract for NHS provider organisations and it also featured in the new 2016/17 CCG Assessment and Improvement Framework.

Planned actions in previous reports have been linked to the 2016 – 2019 Equality & Diversity Strategic Objectives for the Trust, approved in July 2016 and integrated into the Trust's Equality & Diversity Action Plans. (The current plan is included in the 2017-2018 Equality & Diversity Annual Report.)

Purpose

This report provides the information which will be included in the Trust's published WRES report this year. It includes the data for the nine metrics (with the exception of Indicator 4) which was submitted to NHS England via UNIFY2 by the deadline of 10th August 2018. This data forms the basis of NHS England's report into the WRES which is due in late 2018/early 2019. It also includes progress to date against the WRES actions included in the Equality & Diversity Action Plans published in August 2016 and September 2017, together with additional suggested actions for 2018/2019.

Feedback from the Trust's BAME Workers Forum is included in this report.

Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) – 2018 Report

The data which has been submitted to NHS England, comparisons with previous years' data and actions taken and planned, is shown below.

Workforce Indicators – for each of the four workforce indicators, compare the data for white and BME staff.

Percentage of staff in each of the AfC Bands 1-9 or Medical and Dental subgroups and VSM (including executive Board members) compared with the percentage of staff in the overall workforce disaggregated by: Non-clinical staff; Clinical staff – of which Non-Medical staff; Medical & Dental staff

Data for repo	orting year (2	018)	Data for prev	ious year (20	17)	Narrative	Action taken and planned
	xforce = 83.19 (2% unknow al Staff		Overall workf 15.3% BME (given)		White and Not stated/Not	Data is as at 31 st March 2017 and 31 st March 2018, as submitted via UNIFY2.	Actions taken: Training to raise awareness of unconscious bias/stereotyping included in Recruiting the Best training for recruiting managers from
	White	BME	Non-Clinica	Staff		The percentage shown is	November 2016. Also included in
Band 1	45.8%	52.6%		White	BME	for each pay band. Whilst the percentage of	Corporate Induction section on
Band 2	87.0%	12.0%	Band 1	47.8%	50.7%	BME staff in the lowest	Equality & Diversity and revised
Band 3	89.4%	10.0%	Band 2	87.5%	12.1%	band (Band 1) is much	Equality, Diversity & Human Rights training, available from end of
Band 4	94.1%	5.0%	Band 3	90.4%	9.6%	higher than that in the overall workforce, BME	February 2017.
Band 5	92.1%	7.5%	Band 4	94.1%	5.7%	staff are under-represented	Anonymising of application forms as presented for shortlisting.
Band 6	92.3%	7.0%	Band 5	94.1%	5.9%	in other Agenda for Change	presented for shortilsting.
Band 7	95.0%	4.3%	Band 6	89.7%	9.6%	pay bands, especially at senior levels.	Planned actions for 2017/2018
Band 8A	94.8%	5.2%	Band 7	96.0%	4.0%		(ongoing): • Remedy the
Band 8B	97.9%	2.1%	Band 8A	93.0%	7.0%	The exception is Band 5 non-medical clinical staff –	disproportionately high
Band 8C	95.5%	4.5%	Band 8B	100.0%	0.0%	typically from the Nursing &	numbers of Medical & Dental staff with unknown or
Band 8D	100.0%	0.0%	Band 8C	95.5%	5.0%	Midwifery staff group.	unrecorded ethnicity
Band 9	100.0%	0.0%	Band 8D	100.0%	0.0%	New aliainal staff on Danal 4	Encourage more applicants
VSM	100.0%	0.0%	Band 9	100.0%	0.0%	Non-clinical staff on Band 1 would typically be from the	from BME backgrounds through promoting career
(Where the t	totals do not a of the remain	add up to 100%, ning staff is not			0.0% dd up to 100%, the staff is not known or	Estates & Ancillary staff group.	opportunities (including apprenticeships and traineeships) in appropriate local schools & colleges

WRES Update Report – September 2018 Approved

NHS Foundation Trust Dental pay grades more Apprentice recruitment data Clinical Staff - Non-Medical Clinical Staff - Non-Medical (including gender, ethnicity, closely align with the ethnic BME White White BME age etc) will be tracked and make-up of the overall 65.1% Band 1 33.9% Band 1 67.5% 31.6% reported upon to the workforce. Education Skills Funding Band 2 80.4% 19.3% Band 2 80.7% 19.1% Agency and thereby shared Band 3 87.1% 12.9% 11.5% Band 3 88.5% with HM Inspectorate Ofsted Where the totals do not add 7.6% Band 4 92.4% Band 4 91.8% 8.2% to inform a future inspection up to 100%, the ethnicity of of the Trust's apprenticeship Band 5 79.3% 19.8% the remaining staff is not Band 5 78.6% 20.5% provision known or not stated. This Band 6 89.9% 9.6% 90.1% 9.4% Band 6 Review the advertising and is most frequent among Band 7 94.8% 4.7% 95.0% selection process for internal Band 7 5.0% Medical & Dental grades. opportunities to ensure Band 8A 93.0% 6.1% Band 8A 94.0% 6.0% (137 of 191 staff with transparency and equality of unknown or not stated Band 8B 96.5% 96.5% 3.5% 3.5% Band 8B opportunity ethnicity in the whole Band 8C 95.1% 2.4% Band 8C 97.1% 2.9% workforce.) Band 8D 87.5% 0.0% Band 8D 90.0% 0.0% Links to the Equality & Diversity Band 9 100.0% 0.0% Band 9 100.0% 0.0% Strategic Objective for 2016 – 2019: VSM VSM 100.0% To improve the opportunities for 100.0% 0.0% 0.0% members of our diverse Clinical Staff - Medical & Dental communities to gain employment Clinical Staff - Medical & Dental with and progress within the Trust. White BME White BME Consultants Links to the Corporate Objective for Consultants (including Senior 2018/2019: (including Senior Medical Staff) 82.1% 15.7% Significant increase in the percentage Medical Staff) 80.4% 16.0% Non-consultant of staff who are BAME, particularly at Non-consultant career grades 70.6% 27.1% management levels 64.0% 25.8% career grades 14.4% Trainee grades 81.3% 73.3% Trainee grades 11.7% Other 50.0% 50.0% Other 47.6% 4.8%

Planned additional action(s) for 2018/2019:

- Work with Bristol Manifesto for Race Equality HR Leads to develop city-wide recruitment initiatives
- Develop a workplan to ensure the Trust is promoted as an employer of choice to people from all protected groups
- Introduction of Reverse Mentoring Scheme involving staff from BAME backgrounds and senior managers in October 2018

WRES Update Report – September 2018 Approved **University Hospitals Bristol**

- Promotion of Leadership & Management development training to staff from protected groups, through delivery of presentation to E&D Group, BAME Forum and other appropriate groups.
- Open forum discussions during October 2018 with the BAMEW Forum and Trust Equality & Diversity Group about barriers to progression and how best to remove them.

2. Relative likelihood of BME staff being appointed from shortlisting compared to that of White staff being appointed from shortlisting across all posts

Data for reporting year (2018)	Data for previous year (2017)	Narrative	Action taken and planned
		Data is for April 2016 to March 2017 and for April 2017	Actions taken:
White staff 2.23 times more	White staff 1.9 times more	to March 2018, as submitted via UNIFY 2.	As for Indicator 1, above relating to
likely to be appointed from	likely to be appointed from		Recruitment.
shortlisting than BME staff.	shortlisting than BME staff.	The data is taken from the TRAC system used for all	Planned actions for 2017/2018 (ongoing):
		recruitment episodes.	As for Indicator 1, above relating to
			Recruitment.
		More detailed data is published on the Trust's website	
		at Equality Performance & Objectives	Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic
			Objective for 2016 – 2019:
		The numbers of staff appointed whose ethnicity has	To improve the opportunities for
		not been recorded continues to reduce.	members of our diverse
			communities to gain employment
		The data for white and BME staff being shortlisted from	with and progress within the Trust.
		application shows that the relative likelihoods are much	
		closer. This would seem to indicate that "blind"	Links to the Corporate Objective for
		shortlisting is quite effective in removing the effect of	2018/2019:
		unconscious bias. It also indicates the importance of	Significant increase in the percentage of
		ensuring that staff who interview are appropriately	staff who are BAME, particularly at
		trained – including the impact of unconscious bias.	management levels

Planned additional action(s) for 2018/2019:

Additional actions described for Indicator 1 should also influence the outcomes for this indicator.

measured by entry	into a formal disciplina	ry investigation*	ry process, compared to that of White sta g average of the current year and the pre	aff entering the formal disciplinary process, as vious year
Data for 2018	Data for 2017	Data for 2016	Narrative	Action taken and planned
Relative likelihood of BME staff entering the formal disciplinary process is 3.2 times greater than white staff	Relative likelihood of BME staff entering the formal disciplinary process is 2.38 times greater than White staff	Relative likelihood of BME staff entering the formal disciplinary process is 2.49 times greater than White staff	2016 data is for cases live between 1 st April 2015 and 31 st March 2016, excluding ongoing cases live during the previous reporting period. 2017 data is for cases live between 1 st April 2016 and 31 st March 2017, excluding cases live during the previous reporting period. 2018 data is for cases live between 1 st April 2017 and 31 st March 2018, excluding cases live during the previous reporting period. All as submitted via UNIFY2. The number of cases involving members of staff in lower pay bands remains relatively high, and there has been an increase in reporting of cases involving medical and dental staff. 22 cases involving estates & ancillary staff – 11 of them BME staff.	 Actions taken: Further analysis of the data for 2015/2016 and 2016/2017, comparing entry into the disciplinary process by pay band shows that the majority of cases involve staff from lower pay bands. 50.7% of non-clinical staff in Band 1 are from BME backgrounds (as at 31st March 2017). Planned actions for 2017/2018 (ongoing): Further examination of the last two years' worth of data to identify any particular areas or departments with a particularly high incidence of disciplinary cases Joint HR/Staff Side 'surgeries' where the application of the disciplinary policy and process is discussed with managers, supervisors and staff Actions in Divisional Improving Staff Experience plans to reduce the number of formal disciplinary cases – especially involving BME staff – where appropriate Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic Objective for 2016 – 2019: To work towards a more inclusive and supportive working environment for all of our staff.

Planned additional action(s) 2018/2019:

• Audit of equitable application of Disciplinary Policy and Procedure within Employee Services

Data for reporting year (2018)	Data for previous year (2017)	Narrative			Action taken and planned		
Relative likelihood of white staff accessing non-mandatory training is 1.42 times greater.	Complete data not available.	Diversity data is recorded for all training under Learning Management System. However, not training uses this system. As the data require submission calculates the relative likelihood be comparison with the overall workforce, this ha included as the numbers will not be statisticall As an alternative, the responses to Q18a of the Staff Survey have been used.	 The recording and reporting of non-Mandatory training data was included in the WRES action plans for 2015 and 2016. Planned actions for 2017/2018: Divisional E&D reps to work with Divisional training leads – with support from the BAMEW Forum - to promote non-mandatory training and Continuing Professional Development to BME staff 				
		Descriptor	BME 2017	White 2017	 The Trust has implemented a support programme of basic and functional skills, for all employees, designed to improve literacy and 		
		Number of staff in workforce	1,398	7,829	numeracy standards and to facilitate progression onto an apprenticeship programme.		
		Number of staff who stated they had received training, learning or development in the last 12 months (not including mandatory training)	297	2,362	Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic Objectives for 2016 – 2019: To improve the opportunities for members of our		
		Likelihood of receiving such training	0.212	0.301	diverse communities to gain employment with and progress within the Trust.		
		Relative likelihood of White staff accessing non-mandatory training compared to BME staff (0.301/0.212) = 1.42 times greater			To work towards a more inclusive and supportive working environment for all of our staff.		

Planned additional action(s) for 2018/2019:

- Promotion of Leadership & Management development training to staff from protected groups, through delivery of presentation to E&D Group, BAME Forum and other appropriate groups
- Open forum discussions during October 2018 with the BAMEW Forum and Trust Equality & Diversity Group about barriers to progression and how best to remove them.

WRES Update Report – September 2018 Approved

National NHS Staff Survey indicators. For each of the four staff survey indicators, compare the outcomes of the responses for White and BME Staff

KF 25. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in last 12 months

Data for 2018 (2017 Survey results)	Data for 2017 (2016 Survey results)	Data for 2016 (2015 Staff Survey results)	Narrative	Action taken and planned
Vesure 26.16% BME 25.00%	White 27.22% BME 27.86%	White 28.12% BME 30.36%	Data is based on the National Staff Survey returns, as submitted via UNIFY2. (All substantive staff receive a Staff Survey to complete.) The following are the average (median) scores for acute trusts, as taken from the published full NHS Staff Survey result for 2017: White: 27% BME: 28% The 2016 data is included for comparison. The official template requires only two years' worth of data. It is positive to see a continued reduction in the percentage of BME staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public as reported in the Staff Survey.	 Actions taken: Harassment & Bullying Advisors continue to provide support through a confidential helpline and email address on a rota basis. Staff awareness that clinical incident reporting can be used to report incidents of harassment, bullying, abuse or discrimination by patients, relatives and the general public raised through Divisional E&D reps. Actions planned 2016/2017 (ongoing): Through the Equality & Diversity Group, explore how best to communicate our expectations of the behaviours associated with the Trust Value of Respecting Everyone to both staff and patients and service users. Actions planned 2017/2018 (ongoing): Targeted interventions at Divisional level where Staff Survey results have indicated there is a need (Divisional Improving Staff Experience plans will include details) Work on guidance and support for staff experiencing racial abuse from patients with cognitive impairments (for example, dementia), and how to communicate expectations of behaviours to these patients. (Working with Dementia team and BAMEW Forum members.) Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic Objective for

5

	2016 – 2019:
	To work towards a more inclusive and
	supportive working environment for all of our
	staff.

Planned additional action(s) 2018/2019:

6

• Develop and publish support for staff who are verbally or physically abused by patients

KF 26. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from staff in last 12 months

Data for 2018 (2017 Survey results)	Data for 2017 (2016 Survey results	Data for 2016 (2015 Staff Survey results)	Narrative	Actions taken and planned
White 22.61% BME 28.31%	White: 22.73% BME: 28.13%	White 25.06% BME 33.76%	Data is based on the National Staff Survey returns, as submitted via UNIFY2. (All substantive staff receive a Staff Survey to complete.) The following are the average (median) scores for acute trusts, as taken from the published full NHS Staff Survey results for 2017: White: 25% BME: 27% The 2016 data is included for comparison. The official template requires only two years' worth of data. In spite of all of the actions taken to tackle bullying and	 Actions taken: Harassment & Bullying Advisors continue to provide support through a confidential helpline and email address on a rota basis. Equality, Diversity & Human Rights e-learning package available to all staff from end of February 2017. Includes section on harassment and bullying at work. Included in Essential Training 3-yearly updates from September/October 2017. Launch of new Dignity at Work Policy used to promote positive behaviours across the Trust. Rollout during October/November 2017 included discussions and presentations across the Trust. Targeted interventions at Divisional level where Staff Survey results have indicated there is a need as part of Divisional Improving Staff Experience plans Provision of face to face Equality, Diversity & Human Rights training – from October 2017 Launch of Leadership Behaviours at UH Bristol during August 2017 – workshops promoting positive leadership behaviours cascaded during Autumn 2017.

harassment at work, these are still unacceptably high scores.	 Promotion of Freedom to Speak Up Guardian and Advocates as additional sources of support Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic Objective for 2016 – 2019: To work towards a more inclusive and supportive working environment for all of our staff. Corporate plan 2018/2019: Reduction of 30% in experience of bullying & harassment as
	reported in the Staff Survey

Planned additional action(s) 2017/2018:

- Senior Leader workshop in September to discuss different approaches to tackling bullying and harassment. A detailed plan will be presented to the Senior Leadership Team in November 2018.
- Divisions to identify service actions and interventions to improve this result as part of Divisional Improving Staff Experience Plans

7 KF 21. Percentage believing that trust provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion

Data for 2018 (2017 Survey results)	Data for 2017 (2016 Survey results	Data for 2016 (2015 Staff Survey results)	Narrative	Action taken and planned
White 90.57% BME 69.29%	White 90.54% BME 77.49%	White 89.42% BME 73.26%	Data is based on the National Staff Survey returns, as submitted via UNIFY2. (All substantive staff receive a Staff Survey to complete.) The following are the average (median) scores for acute trusts, as taken from the published full NHS Staff Survey results for 2017: White: 87% BME: 75%	 Actions taken: Training to raise awareness of unconscious bias/stereotyping included in Recruiting the Best training for recruiting managers from November 2016. Also included in Corporate Induction section on Equality & Diversity and revised Equality, Diversity & Human Rights training, available from end of February 2017. Planned actions 2017/2018 (ongoing): Review the advertising and selection process for internal opportunities to ensure transparency and equality of opportunity The Trust is developing progression and learning pathways for existing staff, through the

The 2016 data is included for comparison. The official template requires only two years' worth of data. It is evident that the perception of BME staff is that opportunities for career progression are limited. It has therefore been defined as an organisational priority in Divisional Improving Staff Experience Plans to identify service actions and interventions to improve this result.	 apprenticeship structure, to develop within their career and into leadership and management opportunities Divisional E&D reps to work with Divisional training leads – with support from the BAMEW Forum - to promote non-mandatory training and Continuing Professional Development to BME staff Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic Objectives for 2016 – 2019: To improve the opportunities for members of our diverse communities to gain employment with and progress within the Trust. To work towards a more inclusive and supportive working environment for all of our staff. Links to the Corporate Objective for 2018/2019: Significant increase in the percentage of staff who are BAME, particularly at management levels

Planned additional action(s) 2018/2019:

- Work with Bristol Manifesto for Race Equality HR Leads to develop city-wide recruitment initiatives
- Develop a workplan to ensure the Trust is promoted as an employer of choice to people from all protected groups
- Introduction of Reverse Mentoring Scheme involving staff from BAME backgrounds and senior managers in October 2018
- Promotion of Leadership & Management development training to staff from protected groups, through delivery of presentation to E&D Group, BAME Forum and other appropriate groups.
- Divisions to identify service actions and interventions to improve this result as part of Divisional Improving Staff Experience Plans
- Open forum discussions during October 2018 with the BAMEW Forum and Trust Equality & Diversity Group about barriers to progression and how best to remove them.

8 Q17. In the last 12 months have you personally experienced discrimination at work from any of the following? b) Manager/team leader or other colleagues

Data for 2018 (2017	Data for 2017 (2016	Data for 2016 (2015	Narrative	Action taken and planned
Survey results)	Survey results	Staff Survey results)		
White 6.96%	White 6.33%	White 6.08%	Data is based on the National Staff Survey returns, as submitted via UNIFY2. (All	Actions taken: Harassment & Bullying Advisors continue to provide support through a confidential helpline and email
BME 16.01%	BME 13.45%	BME 17.36%	substantive staff receive a Staff Survey to complete.) The following are the average (median) scores for acute trusts, as taken from the published full NHS Staff Survey results for 2017: White: 7% BME: 15% The 2016 data is included for comparison. The official template requires only two years' worth of data. The rise in the number of BME staff who tell us through the Staff Survey that they have experienced discrimination at work from a colleague is also concerning. It has also been defined as an organisational priority in Divisional Improving Staff Experience Plans to identify service actions and interventions to improve this result.	 address on a rota basis. New Equality, Diversity & Human Rights e-learning package available to all staff from end of February 2017. Includes section on harassment and bullying at work. Included in Essential Training 3-yearly updates from September/October 2017. Launch of new Dignity at Work Policy used to promote positive behaviours across the Trust. Rollout during October/November 2017 included discussions and presentations across the Trust. Targeted interventions at Divisional level where Staff Survey results have indicated there is a need as part of Divisional Improving Staff Experience plans Provision of face to face Equality, Diversity & Human Rights training – from October 2017 Launch of Leadership Behaviours at UH Bristol during August 2017 – workshops promoting positive leadership behaviours cascaded during Autumn 2017. Promotion of Freedom to Speak Up Guardian and Advocates as additional sources of support Inclusion events promoting the Trust's three Staff Forums (including BAMEW Forum) to raise awareness of support available to staff from their peers Actions planned 2016/2017 (ongoing): Through the Equality & Diversity Group, explore how

WRES Update Report – September 2018 Approved

	best to communicate our expectations of the behaviours associated with the Trust Value of Respecting Everyone to both staff and patients and service users.
	Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic Objective for 2016 – 2019: To work towards a more inclusive and supportive working environment for all of our staff.

Planned additional action(s) 2017/2018:

- Senior Leader workshop in September to discuss different approaches to tackling bullying and harassment. A detailed plan will be presented to the Senior Leadership Team in November 2018.
- Divisions to identify service actions and interventions to improve this result as part of Divisional Improving Staff Experience Plans

Board Representation Indicator. For this indicator, compare the difference for White and BME staff.

9 Percentage difference between the organisations' Board voting membership and its overall workforce, and the Board's Executive membership and its overall workforce

Data for 2018	Data for 2017	Narrative	Action taken and planned
93.8% of Voting Board Members –	93.8% of Voting Board Members –	Data as submitted	Actions planned 2016/2017 (ongoing):
White	White	via UNIFY2 in 2017	A review of the criteria for selection of candidates by executive
0% of Voting Board Members –	0% of Voting Board Members –	and 2018.	search agencies, ensuring they are committed to diversity.
BME	BME		
Overall workforce BME – 14.8%	Overall workforce BME – 15.3%	Please note that	A review of the diversity of Governors in partnership with the
Percentage difference between	Percentage difference between	from 2017 the	Membership Office.
Voting Board Membership & overall	Voting Board Membership & overall	UNIFY2 submission	
workforce = -14.8%	workforce = -15.3%	asked for	These actions are still considered appropriate to address the
		unknown/null	apparent disparity between Board membership and the overall
Exec Board membership = 100%	Exec Board membership = 100%	ethnicity, hence the	workforce.
White	White	figures of less than	
		100%	Links to the Equality & Diversity Strategic Objectives for 2016 –

2019: To improve the opportunities for members of our diverse communities to gain employment with and progress within the Trust. To work towards a more inclusive and supportive working environment for all of our staff. Links to the Corporate Objective for 2018/2019: Significant increase in the percentage of staff who are BAME,
particularly at management levels

Conclusion

The Trust is committed to improving the response to the Staff Survey question about equal opportunities for career progression and is actively working to establish what is blocking progression and what the organisation can do to remove the barriers. The outcome of these discussions and actions taken by the Trust should also contribute to an increase in the number of BAME staff in more senior positions in the Trust.

Members of the Trust's BAME Forum are actively engaged in these conversations and are also contributing to the national WRES Frontline Staff Discussion Forum. Their input and participation is crucial to the delivery of the planned actions

Also vital to the continuous improvement in the experience of our BME staff is the engagement of the Trust's Senior Leaders. The Board welcomed a discussion with Yvonne Coghill (Director of WRES Implementation for NHS England) in September, and Yvonne will be returning in early 2019 to lead a workshop to engage with our senior leaders and other stakeholders. The Board is also being invited to take part in and champion the Reverse Mentoring Scheme.

Accountability for improving the experience of BME staff sits with the Trust Board. Progress is reported into the Board on a monthly basis through the People Committee.